

Volume 13

Towson Journal of Historical Studies is a faculty refereed journal for the publication of original undergraduate work in history.

Towson Journal of Historical Studies, 2016 Edition

2016 Edition's Contributors

Matthew Moriarty
Regina Valentine
Shelby Zimmerman

Copyright © Towson University, 2016

Cover design and typesetting by
Shelby Zimmerman and Matthew Moriarty
Printed by Towson University Press

Contents

	Note from the Department Chair	i
	Note from the Editors	iii
Feature Articles		
Jesse B. Cougle	The Rise and Fall of John Humphrey Noyes and the Oneida Community	1
Matthew P. Guterl	The End of <i>Sakoku</i> : How the Cutthroat Diplomacy of Commodore Matthew Perry Unlocked Japan	15
Nancy Patricia Kupperman	Shinto Transformation and Government Support in Meiji Japan	25
Barbara Steinbock	Jefferson and the Women Who Loved Him	43
Paul T. Ashton	The Education of Samuel Clemens	55
Scott Zisler and Lina	"The Streets Were The[ir] True Homes: " Working Class Children in New York City at the Turn of the Century	71
Book Review		
James T. Callaghan	Galileo, Bellarmine, and the Bible: A Delicate Treatment of a Contentious Issue	85

Note From The Department Chair

It is a pleasure and privilege to recognize the commitment and work of the many students and faculty who have contributed to the publication of the 2016 Edition of the *Towson University Journal of Historical Studies*.

The *Journal* appeared in the Spring of 1998 under the initiative and leadership of student-editor of Ms. Shannon Stevens. The *Journal*

Note From The Editors

As editors of the 2016 Towson Journal of Historical Studies, we committed to produce the best quality journal to date. Not only does this edition coincide with the 150th anniversary of the founding of our university, our sponsoring association, Phi Alpha Theta has enjoyed a remarkable year of reigniting students' passion for historical study. The challenges we faced in producing this edition were far outweighed by the overwhelming support from both students

æ} äÄ-æ&~|c^ÉÁQ}Ác@i^Á^äâcâ [}ÉÁæ~c@ [i^•^ }cÁæÄ~ ~æ|ä, ^äÄà [ä^Ä [-Ä, [i \ \Ä [}ÄæÄ, ää^Ä range of themes in history. We offer you articles that include an exploration of the lives of working class children in New York City tenements, an analysis of the foreign roles of a United States Commodore, and a book review on Galileo's science. The diversity of ideas displayed within these pages is a testament to the scope and quality of scholarship engaged by students of history at Towson University.

V@^Ä, |•cÄæ|cä&|^Äà^ÄR^!^ { ^ÄÓ! [, }Ää•Äæ}Ä~ }æ] [| [*^cä&Ää }c^! ;]!^cæcä [}Ä [-Äc@^Ä|ä-^Ä [-Ä John Humphrey Noyes. In "The Rise and Fall of John Humphrey Noyes and the Oneida Community," Brown offers a glimpse into the rise of religious fanaticism in nineteenth century America through the scope of Noyes' life. Noyes' religious ideology in an era of free love offers a scathing view of human sexuality and loneliness. Brown depicts the Oneida community as an antithesis to Christian values of the time.

Matthew Prevo suggests that prior to the Meiji Restoration in Japan, Japanese isolationism was overcome due to the persistence and admiration of Commodore Matthew Perry. While "The End of *Sakoku*: How the Cutthroat Diplomacy of Commodore Matthew Perry Unlocked Japan" credits Commodore Perry as an individual actor, it also provides a historical perspective on the development of the United States' international diplomacy. As America was rapidly industrializing during the nineteenth century, expansionist ideas permeated beyond the borders of the United States. The Commodore's gusto and demand for respect from the Japanese opened an opportunity for trade and foreign relations which opened Japan up in profound ways.

Continuing on from Prevo's analysis, Nathan Painter uncovers the origins for government support and legitimization of State Shinto. His "Shinto Transformation and Government Support in Meiji Japan" demonstrates the

implications of change in Japan—less than two decades after Perry’s arrival—as

provided us with his editorial experience. We thank all of our faculty editors who volunteered their time in order to review submissions. We thank the Theta-Beta chapter of Phi Alpha Theta, who supported us by providing the use of their facilities. Lastly we thank Felicity Knox for her help in the University Archives.

In editing this journal, we were privileged to review some of the best work that Towson's history department had to offer. Below, is a collection of the essays for this year's edition.

Towson Journal of Historical Studies

Co-Editors

Matthew Moriarty
Shelby Zimmerman

Business Editor

Regina Valentine

Secretary

Amanda Dotterer

Feature Articles

The Rise and Fall of John Humphrey Noyes and the Oneida Community

In the year 1886, John Humphrey Noyes passed away at the age of seventy-three. He had lived in exile in Canada to escape from his past. After spending the majority of his life leading a people who simply desired a sense of community

founded burned and destroyed virtually all of his writings during the mid 1940s.

There was nothing entirely “normal” about the way these people lived, so why give everything up and join? “More precisely, I suggest, that in the case of Noyes and Oneida, the desire to retreat from the dominant social order represented less an urge to be free from the forces of social change than it did a wish to impose order on a world many saw as spinning out of control, even beyond comprehension”.⁹ This was a time in American history where things were not wholly calm and easy. It is not shocking that some people simply desired the support system a community offers. While their practices may have been outlandish, it was just what some people may have needed at this period.

How was it exactly that complex marriage worked in his community? John Humphrey Noyes, the man that was allegedly too shy to talk to the girls that lived in his hometown, was asking everyone to have sex with one another. Of course this is simplifying things quite a bit, as there were much deeper reasons behind this practice. Earlier, it was mentioned that Noyes had been saved and therefore believed he was incapable of sin. This idea would evolve even further throughout the years. Noyes argued that if he and his followers had truly been saved, then they were essentially living in the kingdom of heaven on earth. If they were to be better than the average man, then they needed to love everyone equally. As he saw it, “when the will of God is done on earth as it is in Heaven, there will be no marriage. Exclusiveness, jealousy, quarrelling have no place in the [heavenly] marriage.”¹⁰ The members of the community were all one giant family. Noyes pursued his ideas down some even stranger roads with it. It is not all that crazy to want to love everyone equally however, Noyes was not the perfect saint that his people were led to believe him to be. While he may have had his explanations for the various sexual practices he advocated for, he could not convince or deceive his followers forever.

In the writings that can be recovered, Noyes discusses his concept of male continence and how he believed it would change the human race.¹¹ What exactly was male continence? The basic concept was that the men of the community were taught and trained to not ejaculate during intercourse.¹² This was a crucial function for the community, as they needed some form of contraception to avoid numerous pregnancies. While this yet again paints Noyes as considerably odd, he found a way to defend the teaching of male continence by tying it with his own spiritual experience.¹³ As his nephew explains, “the real meaning of this objection is that Male Continence is an interruption of a natural act (...) must there be no halt in this natural progression? Brutes, animals or human, tolerate none. Shall their ideas of self-control prevail? Nay, it is the glory of man to control himself, and the Kingdom of God summons him to self-control in all things.”¹⁴ It was not necessary for the sex to be enjoyable as it was a spiritual experience above everything else.

Noyes had to ensure that all members of the community participated in male continence for their whole way of life to run smoothly. This required an odd training regiment that everyone in the community participated in. The older members of the community were responsible for helping the youngest learn and practice male continence.¹⁵ Along with this, Noyes took it upon himself to initiate the youngest girls into the community.¹⁶ This is where things really start to look the strangest for him. Noyes always had some sort of made-up reason this was necessary. He was the closest thing to God in the community, so what he said is what was done. He was the one in charge after all, giving him every

Male continence was not one hundred percent effective. There were still a number of accidental pregnancies, as would be expected for a community that had the sexual practices that Oneida had.¹⁷ Often times it was hard to determine who the father was until the child was older, with the best case being that the child eventually resembled the father. Children experienced a strange upbringing in the community. The community was all one giant family, meaning the children belonged to everyone. A mother would give birth to her child only to see it taken away to be raised with all of the other children of the community.¹⁸

One of the more outlandish things the community did was to prevent children from owning dolls and other toys. In some cases they would even burn all the dolls to ensure the children would not become attached to them.¹⁹ This was a common occurrence in Oneida, with there being multiple accounts of mothers resisting having children taken from them.

Along with the strange treatment of children was the strict rules regarding exclusive relationships. "The catch was just how these 'free' sexual relations were to be regulated. Here, just as in his demand for loyalty to his leadership and to his perfectionist religious beliefs, John Humphrey Noyes was the ultimate referee. His demand for ultimate control over their sexual lives was perhaps the most critical characteristic of the community, and it was necessary for the people to continue their lifestyle. However, humans will always be human, so every now and then a couple would grow affectionate for one another and attempt to be exclusive. This was frowned upon in Oneida, and once discovered, Noyes made sure that his rules were enforced. It was a big deal when people got caught, it could tear apart the whole foundation Noyes had established.

Another characteristic of the Oneida Community was the idea of Bible Communism. The concept was essentially that everybody was to share everything in the community. This was one of the theories that extended to

complex marriage and reinforces the idea of multiple sexual partners, however it had far reaching effects outside of this. Bible Communism affected everything in the people's lives from the sharing of jobs to the raising of children. He believed that Bible Communism was yet another method of living the ideal way in the kingdom of heaven on earth. "Formal community of property is not regarded by us as obligatory on principle,' he observed, 'but as an expedient... We are and beg to be excused from association in the public mind with those who are making such experiments.'"²¹ Everything they did in the community was for spiritual purposes. Noyes made sure that nothing they did was misunderstood as anything other than this.

Not everything inside of Oneida was religion and sex. The one aspect that has lived on to this day has been their distribution of silverware. The production of silverware began in the year 1877 and still continues to this day. There is no clear famous for, as it is a rather random factor when looking at the community as a whole. They needed to make money somehow so there were a variety of goods produced throughout the time that complex marriage was prevalent in Oneida. They wove silk thread as well as made silverware.²² Silverware was the commodity that prevailed and lived on long after Noyes, and his time in charge. It was also one of the factors that contributed to Oneida eventually abandoning Noyes as their leader. There are several aspects that lead to Noyes eventually being abandoned, which will be covered soon. Originally however, the production of goods gave the community a source of income and helped create sustainability for their way of life. It became so lucrative that the people would stick together tively complex marriage ogether tl psuely

2020

~c à •Á !^• Á [c[Á

[(cngime idisodu sur, annsiologa)C71.6 (.)-0.715he waaey wer, communi,

Thitriar,

business. The one common theme of the paper was that just about every single issue begins with a piece called "Home-Talk by J.H.N." In the August 4, 1873 edition Noyes wrote an article titled "Faithfulness". In the October 13, 1873 edition his article was titled "God's Contentment". On December 8, 1873, his article is titled "Provoking to Love". In this he writes: "We should not be ashamed to let others know we want their love ... Love generally waits to be asked, and does not bestow itself on indifference or the appearance of indifference; and yet there are many who desire to be loved very much."³¹ A wonderful piece about love between people. However, after learning more about Noyes and the many different women of his life, it is impossible not to read between the lines and see a sad story of loneliness.

Noyes used his mantle and position of authority to create his own sort of fantastical world where he could rule as he pleased with no one to tell him he was a mad man. It was frankly the perfect situation for him as his teachings wound up reaching an audience that accepted them. He may have had decent ideas, such as his concept of perfectionism, but based under his spiritual beliefs alone. Noyes possessed the power to do as he pleased was by shrouding himself with God's will, and with the idea that God approved of his beliefs.

Free love was not always a part of the doctrine that Noyes would teach followers. It naturally arrives based on Noyes's relation with a woman by the name of Abigail Merwin. She was a beautiful woman who really captured the attention of Noyes to the point of him creating the entire Oneida Community based off of his experience with her. Merwin was one of his original followers far back before even the founding of the Oneida Community and he may have discussed some of his religious concepts and ideas with her. It is not clear however how

Noyes became obsessed with Merwin during their time together in 1834, and he soon began having visions of her. George Wallingford Noyes describes one of these visions, "But his vision of her in New York was too great an obstacle. At length in the course of a second series of trials at Prospect he saw her 'clothed in white robes,' and by the word of the Lord she was given to him."³² From a more modern perspective of this account, Noyes sounds completely obsessed with Abigail Merwin to an eerie point. He envisioned Merwin as a gift from God.

After having his vision of Abigail Merwin, Noyes pursued her in the same manner that he would pursue women of his Oneida community many years later. The word "interview" has been used mostly to describe the actual act of sex in the Oneida community. In Confessions of John Humphrey Noyes, he claims he asked and was granted an interview from Abigail Merwin, but it is not entirely clear how he intended to use the term in this instance. "She was under conviction and wished to have an interview with me."³³ While it is not obvious just what is

meant here by “interview”, it sounds similar to interviews that became common in the Oneida community, which meant sexual encounters.

Noyes was obsessed with Merwin and was consumed by the thought of sex and strong desires. His close relationship with Merwin did not last long, and within a very short amount of time. Why would she react so strongly to Noyes of the sexual kind that is found in Oneida, then this strong reaction suddenly appears quite logical. It can be awkward the morning after a one-night stand, and sometimes people never speak to one another ever again. Noyes was ahead of the curve in this sense, he appeared to have been scaring off women all the way back in the nineteenth century. Merwin ran off to the comfort of another man who was not nearly as odd as Noyes was. This demonstrates that the sex with Noyes and indeed in the Oneida community was not always heavenly or able to secure perpetual attachment. His aversion to marriage may also have evolved from his frustration.

His frustration with Merwin is revealed in a letter now known as the “Battle-Axe Letter” which he wrote to his friend David Harrison on January 18, 1837. In this letter he wrote: “when the will of God is done on earth as it is in heaven there

contemplated suicide.³⁵ Ú^!@æ]•Á-[!Ác@i•Á!^æ•[}ÉÁ•@^Á, æ•Áb~•cÁc@^Á*â!|Ác[Á-~|,||Á his desires. She once wrote this regarding her evil nature that “every evil passion was very strong in me from my childhood, sexual desire, love of dress and admiration, deceit, anger, pride.” She wrote further, that to her dismay, even after declaring her freedom from sin she had found, “these former lusts returning.”³⁶ ÁQcÁ•^^ {•Áæ||Ác[[Á, ccâ} *Ác@æcÁ@^Á, [~|âÁ, }âÁ@â {•^|-Áâ}-æc~æc^âÁ, âc@ÁæÁ girl who had problems such as these.

Noyes seemed to convince himself that his urges were actually inspired by God. According to Spencer Klaw, whatever feelings of guilt he had were interpreted as some message. “It came two months later, on a warm evening in May, when Noyes was seized by a desire for Mary Cragin so urgent, and so unadulterated by any feeling of guilt, that he concluded it must be inspired by God.”³⁷ Around here is the point where Noyes appears completely convinced that he truly is a messenger for God. A trugh77y3 01k0 5.2 rugh77yie.v (fo 0.6 (coo hlehrs d) G (thaos urnclueptn)-0.9 (wa gu onadaptabi)it7-1 (1wa guringgn).-1 (he23ItLike]TJ0.006Tv anj

itthaoeacy fts.a37

and desired to have her all to himself. While practicing their exclusive and secret relationship together, Noyes continued to preach the sin of exclusiveness to his followers regularly.

Noyes taught his followers that sexual love, within the sheltering & [] , } ^•Á [-Á& [{] | ^Á { æ! íæ* ^ÉÁ , æ•ÁæÁ@ [| ^Á [íäâ } æ } & ^Á . ÁæÁ { ^æ } •Á [-ÁÁ à íäâ * ä } * Ác@ ^Á [Ç ^! • Á& [• ^! Ác [ÁÕ [äÉÁ P ^ Áä } • ä • c ^ ä Ác @ æcÁ } [Á [] ^ Á , æ • Á , cÁc [ÁÁ enter into complex marriage who still felt any guilt about committing what the world would regard as the sin of adultery.³⁹

He preaches things such as this in the midst of his relationship with Cragin. He continuously tried to sell to everyone that he knew some brand new way to practicing Christianity, yet time and time again he did not live by his own word.

Þ [^ ^•q•Áæ~c@ [íac ^ Á , } æ|| ^ Á à ^ * æ } Ác [Áä ^ & íä } ^ Áä } Ác@ ^ Á F ì ï €•ÉÁæ! [~ } äÁc@ ^ Á •æ { ^ Ácä { ^ Á the Comstock Law was passed. Anthony Comstock was a leading advocate against the distribution and use of contraception, and the practice of male continence was considered contraception. Comstock had been on his own personal crusade travelling the country to secure the arrests of publishers and sellers of obscenity.

his fol3 187..8AFra4 T*

chosen the true life; or if after all I was ... devoting my energies to a mistaken doctrine." She went on to confess that, "sometimes my personal ambition has made me picture to myself more scope & liberty outside; and ... I have pictured a home of harmonious family relations, without the interference of others."⁴⁵ and his way of life. With a little outside pressure, the whole place would come crashing down on top of him. With a little nudge, Anthony Comstock did just that.

With the newest law introduced by Comstock, outside forces were beginning to creep up on Oneida and demand a stop to their way of life. As the pressure headlines from the area.⁴⁶ needed to run. "The following night Noyes crept downstairs in his stocking feet

Noyes lived out his last days in Canada, where he passed away on April 13, 1886.⁴⁷ Thus came the end to the strange life of John Humphrey Noyes. While he was a strange man indeed, he was a passionate one as well. As I have gone through my research on this man, I have struggled to conclude just what it was that went through his head. Did he at any point really believe God had chosen him to spread his message? Was he a sociopath using religion to shroud his devious tendencies? Maybe he was none of these, or maybe he was all of these or maybe he was just a product of a historical moment.

Noyes in
iisnd

Endnotes

1. Spencer Klaw, *Without Sin: The Life and Death of the Oneida Community* (New York: Penguin Press, 1993), 282.
2. David S. Reynolds, *Waking Giant: America in the Age of Jackson* (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 2008), 130.
3. *Ibid.*, 125.
4. George Wallingford Noyes, *Free Love in Utopia: John Humphrey Noyes and the Origin of the Oneida Community* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2001), x.
5. *Ibid.*, xi.
6. *Ibid.*, xi.
7. Jack T. Ericson, "Oneida Community Books, Pamphlets and Serials: 1834-1972," downloaded from <http://library.syr.edu/digital/guides/o/OneidaCommunityCollection/>
8. Reynolds, *Waking Giant*, 165.
9. Ericson, "Oneida Community Books, Pamphlets, and Serials: 1834-1972,"
10. Jason Vickers, "'That Deep Kind of Discipline of Spirit': Freedom, Power, Family, Marriage, and Sexuality in the Story of John Humphrey Noyes and the Oneida Community" *America Nineteenth Century History* 14, 1 (March 2013): 2.
11. Ericson, "Oneida Community Books, Pamphlets, and Serials: 1834-1972,"
12. George Wallingford Noyes, *John Humphrey Noyes: The Putney Community* (Oneida, 1931), 114.
13. Vickers, 6.
14. *Ibid.*, 10.
15. Noyes, *Free Love*, 114-15.
16. Jason Vickers, 11.
17. *Ibid.*, 11.
18. Ely Van de Warker, *A Gynecological Study of the Oneida Community: Original Communications* (New York: W. Wood, 1884), 791.
19. Noyes, *Free Love*, 53-54.
20. *Ibid.*, xxv.
21. *Ibid.*, xxi.
22. Spencer Klaw, *Without Sin*, 54.
23. Thomas A. Guiler, "Rebuilding Oneida: Ideology, Architecture, and Community Planning in the Oneida Community Limited, 1880-1935," *Communal Societies* 32, 1 (April 2012): 4.
24. Guiler, "Rebuilding Oneida," 10.
25. *Ibid.*, 5.
26. Klaw, *Without Sin*, 236.
27. *Ibid.*, 236.
28. *Ibid.*, 236.
29. Reynolds, *Waking Giant*, 124.
30. *Ibid.*, 130.
31. John Humphrey Noyes, "Provoking to Love," *Oneida Circular* (Oneida, New York), Dec. 8, 1873.
32. Noyes, *Free Love*, 2.
33. John Humphrey Noyes, *Confessions of John H. Noyes: Part I: Confession of Religious Experience, Including a History of Modern Perfectionism* (Oneida: Leonard & Company Printers, 1849), 20.
34. Noyes, *Free Love*, 2.
35. *Ibid.*, 3.
36. Klaw, *Without Sin*, 59.
37. *Ibid.*, 59.
38. *Ibid.*, 60.

39. Robert Allerton Parker, *A Yankee Saint: John Humphrey Noyes and the Oneida Community* (New York: G.P. Putnam's Sons, 1935), 32.
40. Klaw, *Without Sin*, 61.
41. Wayne E. Fuller, *Morality and the Mail in Nineteenth-Century America* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2003), 104.
42. Fuller, *Morality and the Mail*, 106.
43. *Ibid.*, 107.
44. *Ibid.*, 108.
45. Klaw, *Without Sin*, 234.
46. *Ibid.*, 234.
47. *Ibid.*, 245.
48. *Ibid.*, 245.
49. *Ibid.*, 282.

expedition was critical in creating US-Japanese diplomatic relations, elaborated on in the Treaty of Kanagawa. It also established and regulated trade between the two nations, supplying Japan with American industrial goods, facilitating the modernisation of the Japanese Empire both militarily and commercially, while bringing about the Meiji Restoration.

As an island nation, Japan had a long history of isolationism, in which the phrase *sakoku* meant “locked country.” It was used to describe the policy of isolation that prevailed in Japan for hundreds of years. Starting in 1603 with the victory of the Tokugawa Shogunate after one hundred years of civil war, a number of edicts were passed which restricted travel in Japan and forbade leaving the country. These acts also prohibited foreigners from entering Japan for trade and other purposes.² In 1542 on the small island of Tanegashima, a • { æ|háæ } áÁ [-Á • @ã] , !^& \ ^ áÁ Ò ~ ! [] ^æ } • Á { æá^Á , ! • cÁ & [] cæ & cÁ , á c @ Á c @ ^ Á Ræ] æ } ^ • ^ É Á Ó ^ Á c @ ^ Á ^ æ ! | ^ Á • ^ ç ^ } c ^ ^ } c @ Á & ^ } c ~ ! ^ É Á Ó ~ ! [] ^æ } Á á } ' ~ ^ } & ^ Á @ æ á Á • } ! ^ æ á Á æ & ! [• • Á Ræ - pan in the form of Catholicism, thanks to Jesuit missionaries eager to spread the word of God to this new land. In 1637, an armed struggle erupted between some forty-thousand Christian peasants and their *daimy* [feudal lord]. One witness to the insurrection wrote, “The most astonishing fact is that even little girls behaved almost joyously in being beheaded as if welcoming death. This cannot be a normal state of mind but a ! ^ • ~ | c Á [- Á c @ ^ Á á } • á } ~ æ c á } * Á á } ' ~ ^ } & ^ Á [- Á c @ ^ á ! Á - æ á c @ É + ³ This was the Shimabara Rebellion, and Japanese conversion to Christianity was troubling to the shogun. Ç - c ^ ! Á c @ ^ Á & [] ' á & c Á @ æ á Á • ~ à • á á ^ á É Á c @ ^ Á • @ [* ~ } Á æ & & ~ ^ á Á Ô ! á • ç æ } Á { á • • á [] æ ! á ^ Á [- Á instigating the rebellion, expelling them from the country and placing a ban on the European religion.⁴ Thus isolationism prevailed rma

twelve-gun battleship. Perry saw service in the War of 1812 and the Mexican American War. He even won the title of “Father of the Steam Navy” • ~ & & ^ • • ~ | Á ~ • ^ Á á } Á } æ ç æ | Á ç ^ • • • ^ | • É Á Ó ^ Á c @ ^ Á c á { ^ Á @ ^ Á ! ^ & ^ á ç ^ á Á @ á • Á , } æ | á æ • • • á *

Ó ^ Á c @ ^ Á c á { ^ Á c @ ^ Á V [\ ~ * æ , æ Á Ú @ [* ~ } æ c ^ Á @ æ á Á ~ } á , ^ á Á Ræ] æ } É Á V @ ^ Á W } á c ^ á Á Ú c æ c experiencing a national frenzy of “Manifest Destiny”, in which the public it was the moral obligation of the U.S. to spread democracy and liberty to Asia, and in doing so, expand the United States trading enterprise. In 1800 was a roman550c notion to many citizens to travel to an alien land with the goal of establishing trade and diplomacy. Daniel Webster, the Secretary of State, described it as a “great national movement” and “one of the most imp

Commodore Perry was indeed a commanding personality. In fact, the Japanese called him, "The Lord of the Forbidden Interior" because he was the only man able to successfully penetrate the thick walls of Japanese seclusion.⁸ From the beginning, Perry was determined to prevent his journey from being another failed mission. From his own personal journal, he writes:

I was to adopt an entirely contrary plan of proceedings from that of all others who had hitherto visited Japan on the same errand: to demand as a right and not to solicit as a favor those acts of courtesy which are due from one civilized nation to another . . . In pursuance of these intentions I caused the crews to be thoroughly drilled and the ships kept in perfect readiness as in time of active war.⁹

Clearly this was not to be another failed mission. Commodore Perry was adamant in his will to succeed where others had failed. And he would achieve his success by any means necessary. Another way in which he commanded in the empire. He refused to see both the lieutenant governor and the governor so, he was sending a message to Japan, that he was to be respected and treated with dignity. And that he would not settle to meet with any low ranking hoped that the more exclusive he appeared, the more respect he would command from the Japanese people.¹⁰

Matthew Perry did not come unprepared for his second voyage; his intent was to learn as much as he could about Japan so as to prepare for the imminent confrontation. He had been carefully studying Japanese military tactics and geography in order to gain an advantage. He made observations on the areas surrounding Edo Bay, detailing rivers and bluffs that empty into the bay. Perry possessed the most accurate charts and maps of his day, which detailed the many islands and waterways of Japan. He was, in truth, a scholarly man, whose methods were unique and probably the reason he was successful in his mission. He thought that a commodore should be a learned man and "ought to be behaving in the spirit of the age and according to science; to observe, study, measure, count, estimate, sample and record in the service of knowledge and for the entertainment and instruction of all."¹¹ So he was not simply a man of military might, but a man of science and reason as well. His careful instruction of his crew probably contributed greatly to his success. Being able to command a ship is one thing, but being able to command a nation is another.

and might of the navy he sailed with. The might of the American navy was at an all-time high. And recently, sailing ships had begun the process of being

converted into steam-engine vessels. These ships spouted black coal-smoke and carried cannons with explosive rounds. To the Japanese, who were still sailing in wooden “junks” as the commodore called them, the American ships were an intimidating and utterly terrifying sight to behold. The magistrate of Uraga described them as “veritable castles that moved freely on the water.”¹² Clearly the fear of American ships was real, if the Magistrate of a castle-town was himself afraid of them. They were wary of foreigners and thought of Americans and westerners in general as being barbarians; uncivilized people who were prone to acts of violence. Ironically, the West held the same view of the Japanese. One Japanese poet, in 1818, laid eyes on a Dutch vessel and wrote “The Barbarian heart is hard to fathom; the Japanese throne ponders and dares not relax its armed defense. Alas, wretches, why come they to vex our anxious eyes, pursuing countless miles in their greed...? Crawling like gigantic ants after rancid meet. Do we not . . . trade our most lovely jewel for thorns?”¹³ Here we see the mind of the average Japanese toward Westerners. The poet describes the barbarians as being greedy, traveling thousands of miles to plunder and

Kanagawa and its Fallout

between himself and President Millard Fillmore. After several days of communication via letter, the Commodore had managed to secure a landing. On March near the capital of Edo.¹⁴ Negotiations began at the treaty house, which was

Perry, on behalf of the President, writes:

The President desires to live in peace and friendship with your imperial majesty, but no friendship can long exist, unless Japan ceases to act towards Americans as if they were her enemies . . . Many of the large ships of war destined to visit Japan have not yet arrived in these seas, though they are hourly expected;

and the undersigned, as an evidence of his friendly intentions, has brought but four of the smaller ones, designing, should it become necessary, to return to Edo in the ensuing spring with a much larger force.¹⁵

Here again we see Perry's commanding personality, but we also see the U.S. intentions. President Fillmore desired peace and commerce between the two nations, but he was prepared to achieve such relations with force if necessary. In 1854, the "The Convention of Kanagawa" treaty was negotiated, which established US-Japanese diplomatic relations and provided trade stipulations between the two nations.

Its lasting impact was so great because it effectively allowed for the Meiji Restoration and the westernization and modernization of Japan.¹⁶ The many stipulations provided by the treaty favored the United States, but that is not to say it did not have consequences for Japan as well. Overall, the treaty maintained that there would be a permanent, lasting peace between the U.S. and Japan. It allowed for the building of two American ports, one at Shimoda and one at Hakodate. The treaty was very important to the United States, because from tariffs placed on goods imported to Japan. The treaty required that any shipwrecked American sailors be cared for and given food and shelter. The Japanese were not completely left in the dark, though. Article VIII of the treaty states, "Wood, water provisions, coal and goods required shall only be procured in other manner."¹⁷ So the Japanese were given monopoly over the provisioning of American ships and their crews. To many Japanese, however, the treaty was unfair and favored the U.S. It was known as "The hated Treaty" by many Japanese.¹⁸ Nevertheless, Perry achieved great success by gaining access to coal deposits and enabling the creation of American ports in Japan, which had a tidal wave effect on other western nations.

Of Perry's voyage and the subsequent treaty negotiated. In a matter of a few decades, the Japanese military had transformed itself from armor-clad samurai artillery. Japanese ships went from wooden sailing ships powered by the wind and large rowing oars, to large steam-powered juggernauts. Japanese citizens could traverse the island by railroad and communicate by telegraph. This could not have happened were it not for the Perry expedition. Certainly, the Japanese had access to western technology prior to 1854. They had begun designing matchlock muskets in the style of the Portuguese as early as 1542. But the rate at which they advanced technologically after 1854 far exceeded any growth in the history of the nation. The molding of Japan into a national Empire began with its technological advancement. From "Perry and Pearl" George Feifer

writes, "The Imperial Naval Academy's establishment followed in 1856. Soon a western-style military school, sire of the passionately nationalistic Imperial Military Academy, took root, while interest in Western manufacture, especially everything promising military advantage, soared."¹⁹ The trade stipulations enabled by the treaty allowed for the modernization of Japan both militarily and commercially. The implications of all this, of course, is the eventual growth of

manner of extraterritoriality. However, like the other two treaties, this one again favored the West.²² It favored the United States and the Russian Empire. It was known as “The Treaty of Shimoda”. This one, another ‘unequal treaty’ established diplomatic peace between the two nations, allowed for trade at the three ports of Nagasaki, Hakodate, and Shimoda, and it allowed for extraterritoriality or prosecution of Russian citizens in Japan by their own governments. Lastly, it established a border between the two nations as a line running through the Kurile Islands, ceding much more land to Russia than to Japan. This last clause is frequently cited as the cause of the ongoing Kurile Islands dispute.²³

Until Commodore Perry arrived, Japan was effectively segregated from the western world. Perry was successful where many others before him had failed because he possessed qualities they did not. In the case of Commodore Biddle, who was too willing to compromise and submit to the Japanese, we see traits virtually absent in Perry. He was a commanding personality, stubborn and determined. Perry’s “The Convention of Kanagawa” was famed for his gunboat diplomacy, and heavy-handed tactics, this combined with his knowledge of Japanese customs and military as well as the geography of Japan, and the Japanese fear of American ships, all to give Perry an advantage over the Japanese. The impact of the end of Sakoku was immense and far-reaching. The convention of Kanagawa was a direct result of Perry’s expedition. It allowed for the growth of American business overseas, the modernization of Japanese military and industry, and eventually the Meiji Restoration and the growth of Imperial power. The convention of Kanagawa

Endnotes

1. Roger Pineau, "Preface," in Matthew Calbraith Perry, *The Japan Expedition, 1852-1854; the Personal Journal of Commodore Matthew C. Perry*, ed. Roger Pineau (Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1968).
2. Tashiro Kazui and Susan Downing Videen, "Foreign Relations During the Edo Period: Sakoku Reexamined." *Journal of Japanese Studies* 31 (1997): 1-24.
3. Masaharu Anesaki, "Prosecution of Kirishitans After the Shimabara Insurrection," *Monumenta Nipponica* 1, no. 2 (1938): 294.
4. William S. Rossiter, "The First American Imperialist," *The North American Review* (1906): 241.
5. Haruko Nawata Ward, "Jesuit Encounters with Confucianism in Early Modern Japan," *The Sixteenth Century Journal* 40, no. 4 (2009): 1045.
6. George Feifer, *Breaking Open Japan: Commodore Perry, Lord Abe, and American Imperialism in 1853* (New York: Smithsonian Books/Collins, 2006).
7. William Rossiter, "First American Imperialist," 239.
8. Nicholas Wainwright, *Commodore James Biddle and His Sketch Book* (Philadelphia: Historical Society of Pennsylvania, 1966), 39.
9. W. G. Beasley, *The Perry Mission to Japan, 1853-1854* (Richmond, Surrey: Japan Library, 2002).
10. Matthew Calbraith Perry, *The Japan Expedition, 1852-1854; the Personal Journal of Commodore Matthew C. Perry*, ed. Roger Pineau (Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1968), 92.
11. *Ibid.*, 92.
12. Feifer, *Breaking Open Japan*, 78.
13. *Ibid.*, 6.
14. *Ibid.*, 8.
15. Perry, *The Japan Expedition*, 166.
16. President Fillmore and Matthew C. Perry, *Letters from U.S. President Millard Fillmore and U.S. Navy Commodore Matthew C. Perry to the Emperor of Japan, 1852-1853*.
17. "Convention of Kanagawa," March 31, 1854, *TIAS* 6 (1942), 1.
18. *Ibid.*, 1.
19. Feifer, *Breaking Open Japan*, 103-10.
20. *Ibid.*, 103-10.
21. *Ibid.*, 248
22. *Ibid.*, 251
23. *Ibid.*, 250

Nathan Painter

Shinto Transformation and Government Support in Meiji Japan

Shinto is still, in a manner of speaking, the soul of Japan, and even young Westernized Japanese who take no part in its manifold ritual, are conditioned, as their parents and grandparents were, by its fundamental characteristics.

. ÁÐæ*æîÁÛ@ã} ã&@æÁ *Gods of Kumano*¹

In under one hundred years, Japan underwent a transition from feudal traditionalism to fascist imperialism. Once an agrarian society focused on a long antiquated isolationism, it rapidly became an industrial and military superpower. Japan accomplished such a remarkable feat? To what does Japan owe this success? Understanding the answers to these questions requires an under-

indigenous Shinto to support a developing Japanese identity which managed to stress the importance of one's allegiance to and identity with "the group," which could be family, clan, or community. This emphasis on the collective reinforced the sense that each individual had a duty to act in the best interest of the group, strengthening the power of each group's leader. This led to an "us versus them" dichotomy. Divisions appeared between Japanese groups, as well as between Japan and outside groups. Eventually, the perception of "us versus them" acquired a dichotomous "superior" vs. "inferior" outlook, with those in the "in-group" seen as superior.⁶ However, as Japan was a heavily forested and mountainous country, interaction between regions was limited. The rough terrain, coupled with the lack of a common language, furthered the sense of isolation and division.

æc

This essay focuses on how the Japanese government of the Meiji era (1868-1912) promoted its own version of Shintoism (State Shinto) in order to increase nationalism, the identity of the nation-state, and the overall support for the Emperor and his claims to legitimacy. Drawing on Shintoism’s history and spiritual developmental background, this essay also shows how Shintoism’s beliefs evolved during the Meiji period and post-Meiji periods to include those of ultranationalists, anti-Buddhists, and traditional fundamentalists. The government, bent on establishing a uniform Japanese culture and common identity, used Shintoism to help justify their claims of ethnic and national superiority for the Japanese people. Shintoism by exploiting its inherent ethnocentrism, thus fostering the revival of ideas from earlier National Learning fanatics. Religious traditionalists cried for a return to moral purity. Ultimately, the government (through its use of Shintoism) and Shintoism (through its focus on the Emperor) both embraced the concept of a divine emperor to further their own agenda.

Shinto’s Way of the Kami

To understand how Shintoism might have changed in post-Tokugawa Japan, we must look at an earlier image in the Japanese tapestry, the very fabric of which is that of time. Shinto, the indigenous religion of the native Japanese, predates the emergence of other religions, such as Buddhism, and philosophies, such as Confucianism, which were imported from China; however as Kuroda Toshio notes, the term “Shinto” was not used to distinguish Shinto as its own religion until recently.¹² Joseph Kitagawa suggests that Shintoism started out as a view “derived” from the everyday experiences of the Japanese people “in the context of their own islands.”¹³ Thus, Shintoism evolved as a belief system, as well as an “identity.”¹⁴ It does not “regard an omnipotent logical principle as identifying itself with the universe.”¹⁵ Essentially, Shinto is another reading of the kanji (神) which translates to “Way of the Gods.”¹⁶ The understanding of these words, or rather concepts, from the original Japanese is important. *Michi*, the second character, means Way (i.e. the religious teachings, as well as the ritual customs), while *kami* (神) means “that which is higher,” or “superior” so it has also taken on a secular meaning. ¹⁷ The concept of *kami* is understood to embody the concept of “worshiping those higher than oneself,” suggesting the reason behind such practices like paternalism, and ancestor-worship. Another important concept was that of the *uji* (部), which was known as “the primary [...] unit” of

society and was the basis for the “territorially based cluster of lineage groups sharing the same tutelary ‘kami’ (trans. as ‘clan’).”¹⁹ The head of the clans were like “chieftains,” who claimed to have authority “derived from cultic prerogatives given [to] him by the *kami* of the *uji*.”²⁰ This tradition of clans is perhaps a precursor to the later tradition of regional lords in Japan, or at least might be

described as being the “lower nature” period.²¹ In early Shinto, the people saw everything as having a soul, or spiritual conscience.²² In the second period in its history.²⁴ In the “higher nature” period, the mythology gave the deities of this “pantheon” complex relationships with one another.²⁵ As the story goes, the Sun Goddess quarreled with her brother, the Rain God. The Rain was violent, and the Sun hid from him, so the world went dark. Then the “Eight Hundred Myriads of Gods” held council in the Milky Way and brought back the Sun,

This explains why water, and the act of washing the body, helped emphasize Kato describes Shintoism as taking on cultural, intellectual, and ethical perspectives. He explains that “when progress is made in the civilization of a nation her religion advances in the intellectual and ethical sense of the term, and thus from nature religion arises culture religion or ethic-intellectualistic religion.”³¹ In terms of ethical acquisitions, the concept of “purity” expanded to of the mind (*Senshindo sakkī*), one should be sincere (i.e. virtuous). “If a man is truly sincere in mind he will be sure to succeed in realizing a communion with the Divine,” for sincerity means “purity of heart.”³² Sincerity would lead to being morally righteous, which would please the *kami*.³³ In the Meiji period, the

Within Shintoism, there was the “inner” meaning (*matsuri*, meaning “ceremonials or rituals;” from *matsurau*, meaning “to serve the *Kami*”), the “outer” meaning (*matsuri-goto*, meaning government), and a unity between the two (*saisei-ichi*, meaning “unity of religion and government”).³⁴ Kitagawa argued that the “inner” meaning, like the ritual use of water, was rooted in Japanese tradition, as seen with Kato’s examples from mythology.³⁵ The “outer” meaning, Kitagawa and “Sino-Korean civilization.”³⁶ Indeed, as Hori Ichiro discusses this point in his book, *Folk Religion in Japan*:

Ethical, magical, and religious elements were blended [and] reinterpreted [...] into Japanese religion as one entity [...]. They intermingled so completely that they lost their individual identities... Confucianism and Shinto have borrowed Buddhist metaphysics and psychology; Buddhism and Shinto have borrowed many aspects of Confucian theory and ethics; and Confucianism and Buddhism have adapted themselves [to Shinto].³⁷

Hori’s main point was that these traditions “blended” together over the generations to the point where they were inseparable, although, as we will see below, many Shinto radicals thought that they were separable. Early Japanese emperors copied the Chinese, and also emulated their “clan” *uji*, which allowed them to justify their authority by connecting it to their clan’s *kami*.³⁸ This system of emperor worship developed because Shintoism allowed for it. Shintoism was considered a theanthropic religion, which meant that it saw “divinity [within] man and nature” as opposed to the Western-style theocratic religions which saw “divinity [...] above man and nature.”³⁹ For in Shinto, “Gods alike with men are

subject to natural law and cannot escape from it.”⁴⁰ When humans died, they

A Nationalist Conspiracy

During the Tokugawa period, the shogun regimes worked to diminish the emperor’s claim to divinity in order to advance their own claim to power. Shinto

across Japanese culture during the time. As Sandra Wilson argued, Japanese nationalism was a special case compared to other historic examples, for their sense of nationalism did not arise from a desire for independence from a colonial superior, nor did it develop entirely on its own.⁵² Japanese nationalism developed quite late compared to European nationalism, and because the government wanted to modernize, it knew it had to insert nationalism into the minds of the people; thus, the government used tactics like compulsory education and conscription to strengthen people's belief in the "nation."⁵³ The government's establishment of State Shinto can be seen as yet another measure taken to foster the nationalistic spirit of the people, because by imposing it in the schools, or rather, in the thought in an attempt to bring together the regional variations for nationalistic purposes. This is similar to how Japan standardized the Japanese language and imposed it in schools in Japan (as well as in colonies, such as Okinawa) in an effort to create a single national identity. It was an assimilation tactic used to strengthen the culture and nation, giving the people a sense of national superiority as well as ethnic superiority; it gave the people a single *uji* with which to identify. In 1870, the government began to centralize power.⁵⁵ They needed a way to legitimize Meiji imperial rule, and stressing the divinity of the emperor along with the cultural heritage and ethnic superiority of the Japanese was essential for eliminating internal struggles. As Tokutomi Soho insisted in 1927:

Nothing is more urgent for the long-term future of Imperial Japan than cultivating in the hearts of the people the idea of loyalty to the Imperial House as being central to all things. There must be encouragement of worship of the Imperial House and the nurturing of a spirit of loyalty to the sovereign and love of the country.⁵⁶

Despite being written in the late 1920s, this comment perfectly describes the 'nation-building' attitude of the Meiji government and of the Shintoists. Because the government supported and pushed for State Shinto, Shintoism experienced a resurgence in the writings of Hirata Atsutane (1776-1843), a follower of Motoori and a scholar of Christianity.⁵⁷

There is a world of difference between Japan and all other countries; in fact, there is no comparison. Japan is surpassingly blessed and clearly is the Land of the *Kami*

being.⁶⁷ Because of this extremist view within the nationalist ideology, many ultranationalist Japanese considered the Nazi and Italian systems to be lesser “manifestations of radical Shinto ultranationalis[m]” because they did not have a well “developed national religious consciousness” that gave legitimacy to their leader.⁶⁸ These beliefs directly connect with Shinto as they show how the divinity of the emperor was used, especially by Kakehi, to justify the nationalists’ belief in their racial superiority above all others.⁶⁹ However, unlike Christianity and Islam, Shinto had “no scripture comparable to the Bible or the Qur’an,” so there was no clear way of unifying the numerous doctrines and teaching from the different Shinto sects.⁷⁰ This lack of organization and need for structure came to the forefront of the Shintoist debates during the Meiji period. Nevertheless, c@^Á T^ááá * [ç^!} { ^}cÁ , æ•Áæà|^Ác [Á ~ •^ÁÚ@á }c [á • { ÉÁ •]^&á , &æ| ^ ÁÚæc^ÁÚ@á }c [ÉÁc [Á promote the nation and unify Japan. Those same efforts by the government also helped radicalize Shintoism, causing many to reject Buddhism and Confucianism.

Cleansing the Faith, Cleansing the Nation

Despite what Hori pointed out about the complex history of intermingling that Shinto, Buddhism, and Confucianism underwent with each other (e.g. Ryobu “Dual” Shinto sect, which believed the sun-goddess, Amaterasu reincarnation of Buddha), Shintoists increasingly fought for superiority, while trying to distance ác•^|~Á-! [{ Ác@^Á [c@^!•ÉÁØ [!Á^çæ {]|^ÉÁ T [c [[!áá Þ [!á }æ*æÁ%!^b^&c^áÁc@^Áá } ' ~ ^ } &^Á on Shinto of Buddhism metaphysics and Confucian rationalism” when he said: “The True Way of the Gods is totally different, dissociated from the teachings of Confucianism, Buddhism, or any other doctrine, having nothing whatsoever in common with them.”⁷¹ Motoori was a man who preferred to “expend [his] efforts on studies of [his own] country, rather than waste it on matters pertaining to foreign countries.”⁷² He led the way for Shinto “purists” with his rejection [~ÁÓ ~ áá@á • { Áæ } áÁÓ [] ~ &áæ } á • { Á . ÁæÁ & [] &^] cÁc@æcÁ , [~ |áá^Á] á & \^áá ~] Á á ^ Ác@^Á students of the National Learning. As for the government’s efforts, it separated Buddhism from Shinto by issuing an edict in 1868. The government supported Shintoism’s turn on the Buddhists, and Shintoists began a violent movement to “exterminate Buddha.”⁷³ ÁQ } ÁF ì Ì HéÁc@^Á T^ááá * [ç^!} { ^}cÁ%!^ { [ç^áÁc@^Á [- , &áæ]Á ban against Christianity held over from the anti-Catholic Tokugawa feudal government.”⁷⁴ ÁÓ ~ cÁá } ÁF ì Ì ÉÁá } ' ~ ^ } &^Áá ^ Ác@^ÁÚ@á }c [á •c•ÉÁc@^Á * [ç^!} { ^}cÁá [[~ * @cÁ àæ & \Ác@^Ááæ } Á [} ÁÓ@!á •cáæ } ác ^ Á . Ác@^Ááæ } Á , æ•Á@æ! •@|^Á&!ácá&á : ^áÉÁç^ } Áá ^ Ác@^ÁÓ ~ á-dhists who knew they had to maintain religious freedom for their own survival.⁷⁵

In the Shinto movement of the Meiji period, Shintoists, mostly from the National Learning School, pushed for there to be a “national” religion. Aizawa Seishisai, a pro-Confucian Shintoist, lashed out at Buddhism:

Our ancestral teaching has been muddled by the shamans, altered by the Buddhists, and obscured by pseudo-Confucians and second-rate scholars who have, through their sophistries, confused the minds of men. Moreover, the duties of sovereign and minister and of parent and child have been neglected

Shinto has not yet established a body of doctrine. [...] Shinto has always been the puppet of Buddhism, and for hundreds of years it has failed to show its taking advantage of the imperial house at a time of political change.⁷⁹

The government had better success in declassifying Shinto as a religion and in the promotion of the nation. As the government moved to use State Shinto to unify the nation, Shintoists and ultranationalists could easily be seen as a single group. Those nationalists that considered their nation superior, desiring those Shintoists that wanted their religious tradition preserved and organized (i.e. "cleaned"), used the government along with the ideas of Japan's ethnic superiority.

In the years leading up to the Second World War, the morals of Japanese society were questioned by traditionalists and nationalists who saw them corrupted by

of love.”⁸⁶ With women becoming sexually and vocationally liberated “from age-old traditions and conventions,” conservatives cried out for something to

own delusions of grandeur and power.”⁹³ There had never been a movement to
of ethnicity within which it had been imprisoned.”⁹⁴

Conclusion

From the evidence presented, it can clearly be seen that the Meiji era government used the doctrines of Shintoism, especially within their own State Shinto, to increase nationalism, unify the nation, and justify imperial rule. Shintoism had already begun taking on a radical exclusionist and ethnocentric perspective since the turn of the nineteenth century. The “religious nationalism” within Shinto grew to include those of anti-Buddhists, anti-Confucians, and anti-Westerners; they were essentially traditional fundamentalists. Needing ways to unify Japan, the government turned to Shintoism and let the religious values within different government branches. Just like the standardization of the Japanese language, the government looked to standardize the faith. In this religious fundamentalism, until the Japanese nation, ethnicity, and government were equated with the Japanese religious heritage and agenda. The government needed to make the entire nation the uji so as to create a shared identity the emperor, or perhaps even the nation and religion itself. The Shinto concept over other faiths, and evolved during the Meiji period into the ultranationalist nation, dominant over all the others by claims of divine origin. This need for a (or moral police), as well as the military’s eventual expansion of the empire called into question, as exclusionist Shintoism and ultra national traditionalism entered the debate in the voices of the harshest critics. With the overthrow of the Tokugawa, Shintoism, its beliefs and practices, evolved due to the rise of the ethnocentric ultranationalists both within and outside of the religion itself. And the government was also forever changed as it shifted to make Shinto a Japanese Empire’s stubborn refusal to surrender during the Second World War.

Their desire to dominate the world and see Japan rise to greatness would be one of many factors that would lead to their reckless and impetuous attack on Pearl Harbour, which would ultimately lead to their downfall.

Nathan Painter

Class of 2016

Endnotes

1. Shinichi Nagai. *Gods of Kumano: Shinto and the Occult, 1st ed.* (Bunkyo, TY:Kodansha Q}c^!)æcá[]æjÁÉÁFJÍ ÌDÉÁRæ]æ }^•^Á }æ { ^•Áæ!^Á-[! { æcc^ááá)Ác@^Ác!æáácc[]æjÁ [!á^!Á [-Á|æ•cÁ }æ { ^Á, !•cÁ except for sources originally published in English.
2. Andrew Gordon, *A Modern History of Japan: From Tokugawa Times to the Present, 3rd ed.* (New York:Oxford University Press, 2014), 4.
3. Mikiso Hane, *Premodern Japan: A Historical Survey*, (Boulder: Westview Press, 1991), 1.
4. *Ibid.*, 4.
5. *Ibid.*, 4.
6. *Ibid.*, 1, 2.
7. Gordon, *A Modern History of Japan*, 4.
- ÌÉÁV@^ÁwÖ!^æcÁVW}á, ^!+Á, ^!^ÁUáæÁP[á~ }æ*æÉÁV[^ [c[{ áÁPáá^ [•@ÉÁæ }áÁV[\~ *æ, æÁQ^æ•ÉÁÖ~!á }*Á c@á•Á] ^!á[áÁc@^Á&æ]áæ!Á&á~ Á, æ•Á }æ { ^áÁÖá[Á.Á!^ }æ { ^áÁV[\ [Áæ-c^!Ác@^ÁT^áá!^•c [!æcá[]Á[-ÁF Í Í È
9. *Ibid.*, 21.
10. *Ibid.*, 30.
11. *Ibid.*
12. Toshio Kuroda, "Shinto in the History of Japanese Religion," *Journal of Japanese Studies* 7, no.1, (Winter 1981):. 4.
13. Joseph M. Kitagawa, "Some Remarks on Shinto,"

- realm where divine spirit seeks to purify itself by rightful self-development." (Mason, *The Meaning of Shinto*, 93.)
31. Kato, *What Is Shinto?*, 31.
 32. *Ibid.*, 43.
 33. However, the concept of ethical purity quickly found its way to being imposed upon women, as they were beaten for cheating, as well as forced and shamed into identifying the frequency of their "unchastity" by wearing "saucepans" on their heads. (*Ibid.*, 45, 49-50.)
 34. Kitagawa, "Some Remarks on Shinto," 231-2, 233.
 35. *Ibid.*, 232.
 36. *Ibid.*, "Japan [discerned] in Buddhism and Confucianism fundamental meanings that had become atrophied on the continent because of over-sophistication." (Mason, *The Meaning of Shinto*, 88.)
 37. Ichiro Hori, *Folk Religion in Japan*, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1968), 9-10.
 38. Kitagawa, "Some Remarks on Shinto," 235.
 39. Kato, *What Is Shinto?*, 53.
 40. Genchi Kato, *A Study of Shinto: The Religion of the Japanese Nation*, 2nd ed. (Tokyo, Japan, 1926; Reprint, Curzon Press, 1971), 85.
 41. Kitagawa, "Some Remarks on Shinto," 238-9.
 42. Joseph M. Kitagawa, "Introduction to 'The Shinto World of the 1880s,'" *History of Religions* 27, no.3(February 1988): 322.
 43. Kitagawa, "Some Remarks on Shinto," 240.
 44. *Ibid.*, 240.
 45. "State Shinto," in *Sources of Japanese Tradition Volume Two: 1600 to 2000*, 2nd ed., Wm. Theodore de Bary, Carol Gluck, and Arthur E. Tiedemann, eds.(New York: Columbia University Press, 2005), 791; Helen Hardacre, "The Shinto Priesthood in Early Meiji Japan: Preliminary Inquiries," *History of Religions* 27, no.3 (February 1988): 296. National Learning scholars held
 46. Kitagawa, "Some Remarks on Shinto," 240, 241.
 47. "State Shinto".
 48. *Ibid.*
 49. Kitagawa, "Some Remarks on Shinto," 241.
 50. *Ibid.*, 240, 241.
 51. *Ibid.*,241.
 52. Sandra Wilson, "Rethinking Nation and Nationalism in Japan," in *Nation and Nationalism in Japan*, ed. Sandra Wilson, (New York: RoutledgeCurzon, 2002), 1-2.
 53. *Ibid.*, 2-4.
 54. Alan S. Christy, "The Making of Imperial Subjects in Okinawa," *positions: east asia cultures critique* 1, no. 3 (Winter 1993): 610.
 55. Kitagawa, "Introduction to 'The Shinto World of the 1880s,'" 324.
 56. Tokutomi Soho, "Worship of the Imperial House", in *Sources of Japanese Tradition*, de Bary et. al eds. 806.
 57. Hirata was largely associated with the National Learning ideals.
 58. Kitagawa, "Introduction to 'The Shinto World of the 1880s,'" 322.
 59. Hirata Atsutane, *Hirata Atsutane Zenshu* Vol. 1 (Tokyo: Itchido Shoten, 1911-18), 22, cited in Wilburn Hansen, "The Medium is the Message: Hirata Atsutane's Ethnography of the World Beyond," *History of Religions* 45, no. 4 (May 2006): 339-40.
 60. Hirata Atsutane, "the Land of the Gods," in *Sources of Japanese Tradition*, de Bary et al., eds., 512.

61. Hirata spoke of the reverence that “all other” countries had of Japan, as it was “the Land of the Kami.” This claim to divinity further emphasized the Japanese sense of superiority. When compared to other countries, Japan was superior to them all in every way.
62. Walter A. Skya, *Japan’s Holy War* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2009), 218.
63. *Ibid.*, 22.
64. *Ibid.*, 19, 22.
65. *Ibid.*, 218-9.
66. *Ibid.*, 219.
67. *Ibid.*
68. *Ibid.*, 223.
69. *Ibid.*, 219-220.
70. Kitagawa, “Some Remarks on Shinto,” 228.
71. Kitagawa, “Some Remarks on Shinto,” 239; Motoori Norinaga, “First Steps into the Mountain,” in *Sources of Japanese Tradition*, 500.
72. Motoori, “First Steps into the Mountain,” in *Sources of Japanese Tradition*, 500.
73. Kitagawa, “Some Remarks on Shinto,” 240.
74. *Ibid.*, 240-1.
75. Kitagawa, “Introduction to ‘The Shinto World of the 1880s,’” 325.
76. Aizawa Seishisai, “The National Substance,” in *Sources of Japanese Tradition*, de Bary et als., eds., 625.
77. He no doubt associated the Confucian hierarchy with Shintoism as well, as with the worship [-Ác@^Á•~] ^!i[iÉÁSã\ ^Ác@^ÁÁÁ [ÉÓ []~ &ææ } •Áê } ÁÓ@i} æÁc@æcÁ! ^ÁÁ&c^ÁÁVæ [i•cÁæ } áÁÓ ~ áá@i•cÁê } ' ~ ^ } &^ÉÁ@^Á likely held a similar opinion.
78. Aizawa Seishisai, “The Source of Western Unity and Strength,” in *Sources of Japanese Tradition*, de Bary et al., eds., 627.
79. Fukuzawa Yukichi, “Creating State Shinto,” in *Sources of Japanese Tradition*, de Bary et al., eds., 791.
80. J. Charles Schencking, “The Great Kanto Earthquake and the Culture of Catastrophe and Reconstruction in 1920s Japan,” *The Journal of Japanese Studies* 34, no. 2 (Summer 2008), 296.
81. *Ibid.*, 303
82. *Ibid.*, 305
83. *Ibid.*, 305, 306.
84. Miriam Silverberg, “The Modern Girl as Militant,” in *Recreating Japanese Women: 1600-1945*, ed. Gail Lee Bernstein, (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991), 239.
85. *Ibid.*, 242.
86. *Ibid.*, 241.
87. *Ibid.*, 263.
88. Schencking, “The Great Kanto Earthquake,” 304.
89. Kido Takayoshi, “Kido Takayoshi to Sugiyama Takatoshi, January 26, 1872,” in *Sources of Japanese Tradition*, de Bary et al., eds., 678.
90. Schencking, “The Great Kanto Earthquake,” 305, 306.
91. JFÉÁÁcÉÁÚ []i&^Á- [!Ác@^ÁÁW } i, &ææ []Á [-Ác@^ÁÁÁæc []æÁÁÓæc@É+Áê } Á *Sources of Japanese Tradition*, ed. de Bary et al., 796.
92. Skya,

Brittney Smith

Jefferson and the Women Who Loved Him

While we identify Thomas Jefferson as a founding father, the author of the declaration of independence, a president, and even a slave owner, who else was he? Was he a good father, a friend, maybe even a lover? One thing he certainly was is private. This paper is an attempt to puncture that privacy, to understand Jefferson on a deeper level. Whether in his unusual relationship with daughter Martha Jefferson Randolph, or his adoration of Abigail Adams, his need for a perfect woman was a constant. Thomas Jefferson envisioned what a perfect woman should be and would not allow himself to see them differently. He valued domestic bliss and believed that women had 'god given roles.' He saw his women through these lenses either as a lady or a slut. In his view, the former was a wife and mother, whose appearance and disposition reflected her character. The latter was a woman on herself and those connected to her through her appearance and disposition. As seen in a letter to his daughter Martha, Thomas Jefferson judged women not by their minds, but by their style of dress,

A lady who has been seen as a sloven or slut in the morning will never efface the impression she has made, with all dress and pageantry she can afterwards work will be to dress yourself in such style as that you may be seen by any gentleman without his being able to discover a pin amiss.¹

This warning to his daughter reveals Thomas Jefferson's belief that women were not much more than ornaments.

On the search for a wife the third president looked for a woman of intelligence to be able to match his own mind. But this woman had to also possess the talent of a hostess, homemaker, and companion. With luck Jefferson met Martha Wayles Skelton, whom he married January 1, 1772. Martha the daughter of plantation owner, John Wayles and widow of, Bathurst Skelton at the young age of 19 was not only very attractive, but wealthy. This made her a target for the Virginia bachelor's including Thomas Jefferson, who found himself enamored by her. Although little evidence remains of their relationship, due to Jefferson's heartbreak after Martha's death, it is clear that this ten-year marriage was one of love and respect as Martha embodied Jefferson's vision of a lady. Martha's

the affectionate and family oriented life of an isolated Monticello, Martha was
 daughter with ample time to study her father's library and practice her music
 as Jefferson wished. Although he did not believe in the in-depth education of
 women, Thomas Jefferson felt a lady should be educated in language, music,
 and dance, as this will one day please her husband. In a letter to an eleven-
 year-old Patsy, Jefferson gave instruction on how her time should be spent,

With respect to distribution of your time the following is what I should approve.
 From 8 to 10 o'clock practise music. From 10 to 1 dance one day and draw
 another. From 1 to 2 draw on the day you dance, and write a letter the next
 day. From 3 to 4 read French. From 4 to 5 exercise yourself in music. From
 5 till bedtime read English, write etc.⁴

According to Cynthia Kierner, while Thomas Jefferson encouraged his daughter's
 studies he in no way saw her as his equal in an intellectual sense. Indeed,
 because as Kierner states, "Born into a seemingly genteel and orderly world
 that prized feminine virtue, masculine independence, and social hierarchy,"⁵
 his perspective of social hierarchy placed men above women. This hierarchy
 played out in the Jefferson home by taking Thomas Jefferson away much of
 the time on business, leaving Mrs. Jefferson alone, most of the time pregnant,
 ill, in charge of a massive plantation, and quite surely overwhelmed. But never-
 theless she managed to keep her home in shape with the only regret being
 that she did not have enough time to pass these skills along to her daughter.
 Although Patsy was taught to be an excellent hostess, which she utilized in
 later years, Mrs. Jefferson neglected grooming her daughter as a housewife.
 by her eldest daughter, she herself hosted her husband's important guest with
 great ease.⁶ This niche for hosting was passed on to Patsy who like her mother
 was a talented musician, and as a daughter of a very important international
 acceptable companion. These advantages also gave Patsy a glimpse into politics
 leading her to not only campaign for her father, but also her future husband.
 Not limiting herself to the home and care of children, during his presidency
 but also taking control of his social life. This close and some may say needy
 relationship between Patsy and her father may have caused the breakdown of
 her own marriage.⁷ As Patsy so much like her mother took on the emotionally
 supportive role in her father's life as well as hostess, he often asked too much
 of her and required perfection from her to avoid his disappointment. He writes
 inattentive to my wishes and particularly to the directions of that which I meant

for your principal guide.”⁸ Kierner suggests that Jefferson not only expected too much of his daughter, but also was discouraging in her pursuit of civic duties as many women of the time wished to be apart of. Although Jefferson in his letters to Patsy often spoke about his own ventures, he in no way expected or desired his daughters or any other woman to involve themselves within the political arena. As women and slaves were denied the vote, Jefferson also felt is an innovation for which the public is not prepared, nor I.”⁹ Jefferson could of a ‘lady’ she must only play a supportive role to his world, leaving little space for her own agendas or even those of her husband.

In the years during her marriage to Thomas Mann Randolph, her father was extremely loving to the couple and their children, but he was also quite needful of their attention. Writing to Martha shortly after her wedding he states, “I have now been seven weeks from you my dear and have never heard one title from you. I write regularly once a week to Mr. Randolph, yourself, or Polly, in hopes it may induce a letter from one of you every week also.”¹⁰ The lonely Jefferson required Martha’s attention and as soon as he acquired the presidency he required a hostess once again. During the years of 1802-03 and 1805-06 Martha wife. During her husband’s time as

their foreheads with politics.”¹² However Jefferson may have had to eat his own words upon meeting Mrs. Abigail Adams in 1784. As they became friends, the two often debated a multitude of topics and leaned on one another for support during their time in Europe. The wife of John Adams, who was once a close friend to Jefferson and also a opponent, Abigail found herself heavily involved not just politics, but also in the founding of this country as she often counseled her husband. Though the Adams had been separated from one another for several years due to John Adams’ important work, Mrs. Adams took a break from her children and the running of her home to join her husband in Paris. Before her departure she was introduced to Thomas Jefferson who would also be traveling to join John Adams in Europe. After their initial meeting Jefferson wrote to Adams in regards to his wife, “I have hastened myself on my journey hither in hopes of having the pleasure of attendCoslf m -, Aceney

themselves bonding over their children who of similar age found pleasure in visiting with one another. This may have also contributed to Jefferson's respect and Mary during their time in Europe. Even taking on the care of Mary and Sally Hemings upon their arrival in England before traveling to Paris Mrs. Adams wrote of Mary, "she was the favorite of everyone in the house."¹⁷ In 1785 upon the news of their departure Abigail sadly wrote, "I shall regret[sic] that, and the loss of Mr. Jefferson's society."¹⁸ Suggesting she will miss Mr. Jefferson's company; just ten days after parting from her dear friend Abigail would pen a letter to Jefferson, "I have to apologize for thus freely scribbling to you." She adds: "I will not deny that there may be a little vanity in the hope of being honoured[sic] with a line from you."¹⁹ While she and her husband remained in England for three more years and Jefferson in Paris, the two would become even more friendly, exchanging some forty letters attempting to be helpful to one another as seen in a letter from Abigail,

My wrist still continues lame; I have known very Salutory effects produced by the use of British oil upon a Spraind[sic] joint. I have Sent a Servant to See if I can procure Some. you may rest assured that if it does no good: it will not do any injury.²⁰

The two also shared news from home, Europe's gossip, and shopping of expensive goods that were too far from reach, such as the British oil mentioned above. Jefferson depended on this friendship in his political decision-making,

, r exofelec008 anotherlefeil me (-)Tol unable1m hobegan1

Jefferson met Cosway while still in her twenties when she was described as, “charming, beautiful, intelligent, artistic, and musical.”²⁸ She was born in 1760, and being raised in the city that birthed the Renaissance, Maria was an artist at heart and an extremely talented musician. She had been invited by the grand duke of Tuscany at the young age of ten to play the harpsichord in concert. The same instrument kept at Monticello and played later by Martha Yæ^|^\•ÁR^~^!•[]Áæ•ÁæÁÇ!•âç!} *Á P^••âæ}Á [-, &^!Áæcc^•c^âÁc [Áâ}ÁF Ì ì €ÉÁÁ%ÿ [~ Á , â||Á , }ââ}Á@â•Á@ [~ •^Áæ}Á^|^*æ}cÁ@æ! •â&@ [!âÁ]âæ} [- [!c^Áæ}âÁ• [{ ^Áç! [!â} •ÉÁV@^Á|æcc^!Á he performs well upon himself, the former his lady touches very skillfully and who, is in all respects a very agreeable sensible and accomplished lady.”²⁹ This musical talent is something Jefferson may have been drawn to as he shared that passion with his wife. Although Cosway, who was already a wife herself to artist Richard Cosway, she was attracted to the tall handsome American and their time together was short but emotional intense. Jefferson while trying to impress Cosway incapacitated his wrists for several weeks and was in need of Abigail Adams’s British oil remedy. In the time it took Jefferson to recover

Endnotes

Editor's note: Thomas Jefferson's letters can be read at: <https://www.loc.gov/collections/thomas-jefferson-papers/about-this-collection/>

1. Thomas Jefferson, Letters, 22.
2. Ellen Randolph Coolidge, Letterbook.
3. Thomas Jefferson, Travels.
4. Thomas Jefferson, Letters, 19.
5. Cynthia Kierner, Daughter of Monticello, 32.
6. *Ibid.*, 39.
7. Cynthia Kierner, Daughter of Monticello, 6.
8. Thomas Jefferson, Letters, 22.
9. Thomas Jefferson, The Wolf by the Ears, 184.
10. Thomas Jefferson, Letters, 54.
11. Thomas Jefferson, Circle of Friends, 275-276.
12. Thomas Jefferson, Daughter of Monticello, 111.
13. Thomas Jefferson to John Adams, June 19, 1784.
14. Abigail Adams to Mary Smith Cranch, May 8, 1785, The Adams Papers.
15. Thomas Jefferson to Abigail Adams, September 25, 1785, 16. Abigail Adams to Thomas Jefferson, June 6, 1785.
17. Abigail Adams to Thomas Jefferson, July 10, 1787, The Papers of Thomas Jefferson.
18. Abigail Adams to Cotton Tuft, April 26, 1785, The Adams Papers.
19. Abigail Adams to Thomas Jefferson, June 6, 1785, The Papers of Thomas Jefferson.
20. Abigail Adams to Thomas Jefferson, January 29, 1787, Circle of Friends, 68.
21. Abigail Adams to Elizabeth Smith Shaw Peabody, February 10, 1797, Founders Online.
22. Abigail Adams to Thomas Jefferson, May 10, 1804, Circle of Friends, 200.
23. Thomas Jefferson to Abigail Adams, June 13, 1804, Circle of Friends, 201.
24. Thomas Jefferson to Abigail Adams, August 22, 1813, Circle of Friends, 241.
25. Thomas Jefferson to Abigail Adams, January 11, 1817, Ford.
26. Virginia Scharff, The Women Jefferson Loved, 79.
27. *Ibid.*, 79.
28. Jon Kukla, Mr. Jefferson's Women, 86.
29. Monticello.org, Martha Wayles Skelton Jefferson.
30. Thomas Jefferson to Maria Cosway, October 5, 1786, Circle of Friends, 54.
31. *Ibid.*, October 12, 1786, 55.
32. Thomas Jefferson to Maria Cosway, October 12, 1786, Circle of Friends, 55.
33. *Ibid.*, January 31, 1803, 191.

Paris Thalheimer
The Education of
Samuel Clemens

Standing on an outside stairway of the Clemens home, young Samuel Clemens bombarded his younger brother, Henry, with dirt clods. To avoid punishment from their mother, Samuel hopped over a fence and did not come back for at least an hour or two. Upon his return, Henry sat ready to ambush his older brother. As Samuel came into view, Henry got his revenge by landing a stone on the side of Samuel's head. With a large lump on the side of his head, Samuel went to their mother for sympathy. Coolly, Mrs. Clemens replied that that some lumps might do him some good.¹ Reading this exchange between mother and son, one wonders how this willful and mischievous child grew into the man who would become the celebrated writer and humorist, Mark Twain. To understand this, we must look at the events and people in his life which shaped him.

Of all Samuel Clemens' relationships, it was the women in his life who made the greatest impact in forming him into not only the persona known as Mark Twain, but a loving husband and father. Through his mother, Jane Clemens, whom he caused all manner of trouble with his willful behavior, he would learn wit, humor and cynicism. As a young adventuring man, he would learn the importance of friendship and personal change from his close friend and mentor Mrs. Mary

raphy and writings. It will never be known how far Samuel Clemens' talents & [~ |âÁ@æç^Á* [}^ÉÁY @æcâ•Á\ } [,)â•Ác@æcÁ , ic@Ác@^â!â} ' ~ ^ } &^ÉÁÛæ { ~ ^ |ÁÖ| ^ { ^ } •ÉÁ better known as Mark Twain, became one of America's most celebrated writers.

Having outlived each of these women, Samuel Clemens would learn grief and

writings and his courtship with Olivia Langdon, whom Samuel desperately wanted to marry. It was also on this trip that Samuel met and befriended Charles

and these lessons remained with him for his life. Jane Clemens taught him to be critically observant of other people. On Sundays, Jane Clemens required Samuel to attend church, something he could not bear. Upon his supposed return from church, she quizzed him about the text in the sermon. Being a clever lad, Samuel would select one of his own. This worked well until one day when Samuel's sermon and a neighbor's, who had actually attended the service, did not match. Having been exposed to the truth, Jane Clemens found other ways to make sure her son had attended church services.¹⁷ It is interesting that Jane Clemens, herself, did not attend church services with her son.

In many ways it was Jane Clemens' wit, humor, and judgmental character that readers see in Samuel Clemens' book *Traveling with the Innocents Abroad*, which was published in 1869.¹⁸ At thirty-one years old, Samuel Clemens traveled with Charles Langdon and Mrs. Fairbanks to the Middle East and the Holy Land. While on board the *Quaker City*, Clemens and many of the other passengers read *Tent Life in the Holy Land*, by William Prime.¹⁹ The book had been suggested reading in preparation for the trip. Samuel Clemens read the book and made several cutting annotations in the margins. In his judgments of Mr. Prime, Samuel judged him quite harshly. He points out that Mr. Prime was a common thief when he observed Prime excusing his own behavior for chipping off a part of a monument saying, "where I see such antiques fast disappearing before the hands of the Vandals, I am not so foolish as to refuse to take what I can." Clemens' wrote: "The customary excuse of a thief." The response was to the point and might easily have been something his mother would have said.²⁰

Ô| { ^ } • Á] ~ cÁæÁ , } ^ Á] [ä } cÁ [} Áæ [c@^!Á [-ÁÚ!á { ^q•Á&i ~ á^Áà^@æçâ [i • Á , @^ } ÁÚ!á { ^ Á describes riding his horse over Moslem graves. To which Clemens responded, "They were the tombs of somebody's fathers and mothers. Would he have desecrated them if they had been his own [father and mother's graves]?"²¹ Just as his mother before him, Samuel Clemens was never timid or reserve in his harsh judgment of people's shortcomings. It was these moments of wit and sarcasm that one can see the foundations of his mother come through the surface of Mark Twain.

Though Samuel might have desired love and approval from his mother, she would hold herself in reserve. In his autobiography, Samuel describes his mother as "warm-hearted," but he felt it natural for her to keep it in reserve due to his father's lack outward affection.²² In her later life, Jane Clemens told Samuel, "You gave me more uneasiness than any child I had."²³ Though Samuel had an eagerness for his mother's love, it was Jane Clemens' critical nature that was poured out on her son.²⁴ Yet when Jane Clemens passed away on October 27, 1890, Samuel wrote, "She always had the heart of a young girl; and in the sweetness and serenity of death she seemed somehow young again. She was always beautiful."²⁵ Even with all of her critical wit, and judgment of her son, Samuel Clemens still loved his mother and held her dear to his heart.

Though Jane Clemens did not give her son the love, affection and approval he so desired from her, she gave him a quick witted and observant mind.²⁶

Mrs. Fairbanks, Samuel and Olivia Clemens

Livy Clemens would be Samuel Clemens's closest friend and truest advisor. The seeds of their relationship began the moment he laid eyes on her miniature ivory image in Charles Langdon's locket during their trip on board the Quaker City in the summer of 1867. Of her, he describes a petite young lady with strength and kindness he cherished even after her death. In 1906 he writes in his autobiography: "I saw in her a rare combination of sympathy, energy, devotion, enthusiasm, and absolute limitless affection." Though frail in appearance, Samuel Clemens saw strong loving character in his wife, which he respected and relied on for their entire marriage.²⁷

It was her caring nature, counsel and insight of people he learned to rely on to make better sense of his world. In many ways, Samuel Clemens saw in Livy the person he was not. Of her judgment of people and life, he says that she was "sure and accurate."²⁸ On many occasions, Livy would clarify or explain to him what he was not understanding. She was certain from the start. Samuel and Olivia's courtship was not a smooth one. They were from two very different worlds. Samuel Clemens was an uneducated boy from a poor family, while Livy was a well-educated woman from a prominent family. In 1868, Livy turned him down.²⁹ A persistent person, Samuel proposed three or four times before Livy accepted his hand in marriage.³⁰ The Langdons were quite surprised and a little taken aback by Samuel's unabashed frankness and frontier ways, traits he would carry for life.³¹

Not prepared to give up with Mrs. Fairbanks' assistance, Samuel Clemens vowed to win Ms. Langdon's hand in marriage. Indeed, his reaction to Livy's rejection did not sit well with him, as Samuel made plain in a September 7, 1868 letter to her. In it, he refers to her as "sister," something she has requested him to view her as. Yet even as he uses this title, he reminds her that as much as the situation pains him, he "loved [her], still [loves] & shall always love [her]." Samuel reminds her that he is used to such disappointment and suffering, and that this will be one more thing to bear.³²

In several letters between Mrs. Fairbanks and Samuel Clemens, the discussion of marriage was a prominent topic. In one letter, Samuel wrote that if he were

or be lazy. As Samuel put it, “I have kept the bond—I failed not in the task you have set me to do.”³⁴ Looking for Mrs. Fairbank’s approval, Samuel worked to stop swearing and improved with time and effort. His only regret was that he wished he had adopted a more active behavior sooner.

QcÁ , [~|äÁcæ\^Ácä { ^Áæ } äÁ] ^! • ^ç^!æ } & ^ÉÁä ~ cÁŠäç ^Á , } æ|| ^Áæ&&^] c^äÁÛæ { ~^|q•Á { æ!-riage proposal. With promises of commitment and reform, Samuel convinced the Langdon family that he was serious and capable of taking care of Livy.³⁵ Jarvis Langdon expected Samuel to not only keep his daughter happy, but ,)æ } & äæ|| ^Á & [{ ~ [!cæà|^Áæ•Á , ^||ÉÁ V[Á ^ } • ! ^Á @ä•Á • [} Éä } Èjæ , q•Á • ~ & ^••ÉÁ Ræ!çä•Á

So important was Mrs. Fairbanks' respect and approval to Samuel Clemens that in an 1868 letter, he proclaimed his joy of following her wisdom to stop being vulgar when speaking. He proudly states that he can be "funny without being vulgar." He explained with pleasure that he had brought honor to his teacher and awaited her reply which he believed will contain accolades for a job well done.⁴¹

and that nothing good can come from sending his critical letter to the newspapers.⁴⁶ Interestingly, just a year later Marie Van Vorst dedicated a book she had co-written with John Van Vorst to Samuel Clemens.⁴⁷

In closing her letter to Samuel, Livy reminded her husband how much she m(hero1 601)-4

less life and had no principles.”⁵² The alarm would go off and Samuel would
 •^æ!&@Ác@^Á@ [~ •^Á [] ^Ác [Á, } áÁc@æcÁ } [Á [] ^Á@æáÁà! [\ ^ } Áá } ÉÁU } Á [] ^ÁTæ!&@Á { [!] -
 ing around 2 am, the alarm went off again. This time, someone was actually
 breaking into the house.

Lying in bed, Livy asked if it were burglar and what he might want. Samuel replied
 with sarcastic humor, “I suppose he wants jewelry.”⁵³ Without missing a beat,
 Šiç ^ Á] |æ ^ Ááæe [] * ÉÁÛ [[] ÉÁc@^ Á@^æ!áÁc@^ Á • [~ } á • Á [- Á • [{ ^ [] ^ Á Á á ' á } * Ác@! [~ * @Ác@^ Á
 house looking for items. As the burglar moved through the house, Livy asked
 what the burglar was doing now. To which Samuel added some new room and
 items being pilfered. Finally, Livy said, “Well, what is the use of a burglar alarm
 for us?”⁵⁴ To which Samuel replied that it had been useful up till that moment.
 Samuel Clemens goes on to explain that the burglar will be quite disappointed
 ä } Á , @æcÁ@^ Á , } á • ÉÁÇ • ÁáçÁc ~ ! } ^ á Á [~ cÉÁc@^ Á } ^øcÁ áæ ^ Á Ûæ { ~ ^ | Á Ô | ^ { ^ } • Á - [| | [, ^ á á æ Á
 trail of his belongings on the ground. It appears that the burglar was in fact
 quite disappointed.⁵⁵ Even in stressful times, Samuel and Livy Clemens were

which the public might not know existed. In her biography of her father, Susy writes that many did not truly know Mark Twain, pointing out that *The Prince and the Pauper* “revealed something of his kind sympathetic nature.”⁶¹

The Solitude and Grief of Later Life

In the last few years of Samuel Clemens' life he had outlived those relationships he has cherished the most. Livy Clemens passed away on Clara's birthday in 1904 after twenty-two months of suffering.⁶⁹ The day before Christmas 1909, his youngest daughter, Jean, was found dead in a tub, apparently from an overdose of morphine.⁷⁰ "now I have lost Jean. How poor am I, who was once so rich!"⁷⁰

Life without the loving presence of women he respected, Samuel Clemens' spirit turned to darker places. For all his wit and vigor for living, he turned his

Endnotes

1. Mark Twain, *Autobiography of Mark Twain: The Complete and Authoritative Edition*, Volume 1, (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2010), 350-351.
2. De Lancey Ferguson, "The Case of Mark Twain's Wife," in *A Casebook on Mark Twain's Wound*, edited by Lewis Leary (New York: Thomas Y. Crowell Company, 1962), 160.
3. *Ibid.*
4. Mark Twain, *Autobiography*, 64.
5. *Ibid.*, 206.
6. Takeuchi Yasuhiro, "A Fascination with Corpses: Mark Twain's "Shameful Behavior," *Midwest Quarterly* 54, no. 2 (2013): 202-217.
7. Mark Twain, *Autobiography of Mark Twain*, Vol. 1, 451.
8. *Ibid.*, 274 - 275; also Lewis Laska, "Nanotechnology and Exploding Steamboats: Nobody to Blame," *Nanotechnology Law & Business* 265 (Fall 2010), 266.
9. Mark Twain, *Autobiography*, 275.
10. Dixon Wecter (comp.), *Mark Twain to Mrs. Fairbanks* (Los Angeles: The Mark Twain Company, 1949), xi.
11. *Ibid.*, xx.
12. *Ibid.*, xvi.
13. Dixon Wecter, *The Love Letters of Mark Twain* (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1949), 2-3.
14. Edith Colgate Salsbury, *Susy and Mark Twain; Family Dialogues* (New York: Haper & Row, 1965), 9.
15. Mark Twain, *Autobiography*, 672.
16. *Ibid.*, 350.
17. *Ibid.*, 351.
18. *Ibid.*, 352.
19. Samuel Clemens, *Traveling with the Innocents*, edited by Daniel Morley McKeithan (Norman: Oklahoma Press, 1958), vii.
20. Mark Woodhouse, "Compassion and Self-restraint: Samuel Clemens and Tent Life in the Holy Land," *American Literary Realism* (2015): 70-71.
21. *Ibid.*, 73-74.
22. *Ibid.*, 74.
23. Mark Twain, *Autobiography*, vol. 2, 358.
24. Ferguson, "The Case of Mark Twain's Wife", 183.
25. *Ibid.*, 185.
26. Mark Twain, *Autobiography*, vol. 2, 610.
27. Ferguson, "The Case of Mark Twain's Wife," 185.
28. Mark Twain, *Autobiography* vol. 1, 320.
29. *Ibid.*, 320.
30. Martin Naparsteck and Michele Cardulla, *Mrs. Mark Twain: The life of Olivia Langdon Clemens, 1845 -1904*, 170.
31. Mark Twain, *Autobiography*, vol. 2, 357.
32. Dixon Wecter, *The Love Letters*, 36.
33. *Ibid.*, 19.
34. *Ibid.*, 8.
35. *Ibid.*, 8, 9.
36. Dixon Wecter, *The Love Letters*, 36.
37. Ferguson, "The Case," 161.

80. Mark Twain, *Autobiography*, vol. 1, 367.
81. Ferguson, "The Case," 160.
82. Henry Seidel Candy, 231.
83. *Ibid.*, 230.
84. *Ibid.*, 231.
85. Mark Twain, *Autobiography*, vol. 1, 367.
86. Ferguson, "The Case," 160.

Shelby Zimmerman

“The Streets Were The[ir]
True Homes”¹: Working Class
Children in New York City at
the Turn of the Century

In the late nineteenth century, Rivington Street in New York City's Lower East Side served as a playground for the children of the working class. Comedian George Burns, who grew up there, remembers all the children from his tenement: "I remember someone to play with," he said, "because the streets were loaded with kids ... when we were all playing together in the street there were so many of us we'd get mixed up and forget which family we belonged to."¹ Children would transform posts, and manholes all served as bases, and make broom handles, trashcan lids, and bags into sporting equipment. They would play late into the evening until their mothers opened the tenement windows and told them it was time to go to sleep. Then the children would leave the street and sleep in their crowded tenement units.²

and Jewish immigrants arrived in New York City from Europe and could not afford to move to another city. In the 1850s, the aristocratic residents of New York's East Side moved uptown, resulting in abandoned single-family houses. Three-fourths of New York City's population lived in the city's thirty-seven thousand tenement houses.³

The tenements were chronicled in a series of exposés by journalist Jacob Riis. Some caution is required when approaching Riis's work. As historian James B. Lane has noted, Riis's photographs and articles tended to promote racial stereotypes and sometimes exaggerated the plight of his subjects.⁴ Still, Riis's

Working conditions were little better. Garment factories in late nineteenth century New York were notorious for their long hours, harsh conditions, and low pay. According to New York factory inspectors, the sweatshop work was “nearly akin to slavery as it’s is possible to get. The work is done under the eyes of
of a high building, put in a few sewing machines, a stove suitable for heating

in which they would climb up clothesline poles, play games on the steps of the tenements, bounce balls off of residential and commercial doors, and use trashcan lids and broomsticks to play baseball.²²

The streets, however, remained dangerous. Children at play shared the streets with adults, some selling goods in makeshift markets, others peddling advertising products, or drinking in outdoor taverns.²³ Games played in this milieu could easily turn dangerous. In *Children of the City at Work and at Play*, Nasaw describes how young boys would attempt to jump on the back of an open-bed wagon in order to get a free ride.²⁴ Resident Mike Gold described how this kind of game could turn deadly. His friend, he said, “had stolen a ride [on a horse-drawn carriage], and in jumping, fell under the wheels. The people car rolled on. The people rushed to the tracks and picked up the broken body of my playmate.”²⁵

Children also had to watch out for the police, who believed that young immigrant boys were responsible for theft and pickpocketing, and who persecuted children for damaging windows and streetlamps.²⁶ In New York’s Midtown West, more c@æ}Á, -c~Á]^!&^}cÁ [-Áæ!|^c•Á, ^!^Á- [!Á|^*æ|Áæ&c•Á•~&@Áæ•Á]|æ^â} *Á•] [!c•ÉÁà^*-ging, shooting craps, and throwing stones.²⁷ Harpo Marx, who grew up there, remembered that “since we couldn’t afford to pay off the cops in the proper, respectable Tammany manner, they hounded us, harassed us, chased us, and every chance they got, happily beat the hell out of us.”²⁸ Mike Gold recalled that “they [police] cursed us, growled and chased us for any reason. They hated to see us having fun.”²⁹ Jacob Riis too described callous disregard for children. According to Riis, “we have seen in New York a boy shot down by a policeman for the heinous offence of playing football in the street on Thanksgiving Day.”³⁰

The American Dream

Working class boys grew up learning about the American dream through the Horatio Alger stories, which inspired them to earn money in order to help their families and to get out of poverty. On the streets or in the schools, the boys learned about the Horatio Alger “rags to riches” story and the importance of hard work in order move from the working to the middle class. According to Nasaw, “they [the children] did not expect to strike it rich. But neither did they expect to live their lives as their parents lived theirs.

V@^Á, [~|áÁ] [cÁ^Ác!æ] ^áÁ}Ác^}^ {^}cÁ'æc•Á [!Á•~^: ^áÁ}c [Ác@^Áàæ&\Á! [[{•Á of heavily mortgaged houses; they would not work all day and then, in the evening, fall asleep after dinner; they would not allow themselves to be marooned by fear and by debt in slums and ghettos while the life of the city swirled on

around them.”³¹ Thus, many children believed that by working hard during their childhood, they could follow Alger’s example and experience the middle class American dream.

There were many employers willing to offer the children an opportunity to work @æ:âÉÁÛc[!^Á,â}â[,•Á,^!^Á,||^âÁ,âc@Á%Ó[^ÁYæ}c^â+Á•â* }•ÉÁ {æ\â} *ÁâcÁ•â {]|^Ác[Á ,)âÁæâb[âÉÁ^ç^}Á- [!ÁæÁâ[^Á, @ [Á@æââb~•cÁâ^}Á, !^âÉ³² It was common for young boys to earn money as vendors, selling items such as pencils, candy, and newspapers.³³ Parents, however, generally wanted to keep their children out of such jobs because they exposed them to crime. They thus preferred that their sons worked as messengers or errand boys because, as Nasaw explains, %^!;æ}âÁâ[^•Á@æâÁâ[••^•Áæ}âÁ, [!^âÁ!^*~|æ:Á@[^!;Áâ}ÁæÁ, ç^âÁ|[&æcâ[}ÉÁØ; [{ Á the moment they left school until the time they arrived home for dinner, they were watched over by responsible adults.”³⁴ The son of Antonio Giordano remembered how he wanted to sell newspapers, but his father refused because he believed that “paper selling makes boys gamblers and bums.”³⁵ Vendors were seen as only one step removed from petty criminals, and parents feared that such children would learn immoral behaviors such as lying about prices and deceiving customers.³⁶

Expectations for working class girls were different. Young women rarely took work selling newspapers or other goods on the streets because those streets were seen as masculine spaces that could corrupt girls.³⁷ Instead, girls were tasked with assisting their mothers, who often had to work long hours outside the home in order to bring in money. It fell to their daughters to do household chores such as cooking, cleaning, laundry, and shopping.³⁸ Such tasks began at a young age. Journalist Riis described how Katie, a nine year old girl, served

Charity

Charity initiatives sought to ameliorate the public health problems of tenement dwellers, and the health problems of children in particular. In 1906, John D. Rockefeller established the Junior Sea Breeze Home for Sick Babies, which temporarily removed babies from the tenements and taught mothers how to care for their children. In the sanitarium, all children, regardless of their race, religion, and social class, were provided with medical treatment from educated nurses.⁴⁴ The hospital's resources helped babies escape the dangers of residing in the tenements during the inhospitable summer months. Junior Sea Breeze nurse Rose Green taught mothers "how best to care for their babies under the circumstances and means at their command," which involved purchasing healthy food and promoting basic hygiene.⁴⁵ In addition, nurses visited the families after the infants were discharged in order to ensure that the babies were healthy and cared for by their mothers.⁴⁶

Another such initiative was the Fresh Air Fund, established by Reverend Willard Parsons in the 1870s. Parson's goal was to temporarily remove working class children from the tenements during the summer in order to improve their health and in order to expose them to salutary effects of rural life and Christian rural Pennsylvania, where they stayed with Christian missionary host families for two weeks.⁴⁷ The program expanded, and in 1891 it sent more than 94,000 children to a vacation in the country.⁴⁸ The Fresh Air Fund enabled children to come malnourishment and disease. According to a young girl who participated in the program, "we have lots to eat, and so much to eat that we could not tell you how much we get to eat."⁴⁹ Volunteer doctors conducted medical tests when the children arrived and when they departed, and used these measurements to quantify the improvement in health.⁵⁰ According to historian Julia Guarneri, the founders of the Fresh Air Fund "believed that by separating a child from his tainted urban environment and exposing him to a rural way of life, they could literally save the child, body, and soul."⁵¹ Parsons wrote that his program had resulted in "the complete transformation of many a child." The child, he wrote, "has gone back to its wretchedness, to be sure, but in hundreds of instances about which I have personally known, it has returned with head and heart full of new ways, new ideas of decent living, and has successfully taught the shiftless parents the better way."⁵² They believed that they could improve the children's morality by exposing them to the middle class Christian paternalism.

In the late nineteenth century, another alternative emerged for young children: the New York Kindergarten Association. Their goal was to establish kindergarten programs in the working class neighborhoods in order to teach young children important life skills through play while allowing them to temporarily escape the

tenement conditions. By 1902, New York City had 100 kindergarten programs,

their ragged and dirty condition, or owing to the fact that they are obliged to

working class children played a large role in the Progressive Movement of the early twentieth century as well as prompting urban reform. Despite the many life challenges, the working class children of New York City, as the evidence shows, knew how to have fun with a small amount of resources.

Shelby Zimmerman

Class of 2017

43. Harriet Quimby, "Saving the Lives of New York's Sick Babies," *Frank Leslie's Weekly*, August 26, 1909.
44. *Ibid.*
45. *Ibid.*
46. *Ibid.*
47. Julia Guarneri, "Changing Strategies for Child Welfare, Enduring Beliefs about Childhood: The The Fresh Air Fund, 1877," *The Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* 11, no. 1 (January 2012): 28.
48. Riis, *Children of the Poor*, 155-156
49. *Ibid.*, 161.
50. Guarneri, "Changing Strategies for Child Welfare," 47.
51. Guarneri, "Changing Strategies for Child Welfare," 41.
52. Riis, *Children of the Poor*, 161.
53. *Ibid.*, 176.
54. *Ibid.*, 178.
55. *Ibid.*
56. *Ibid.*, 92.
57. Riis, *Battle With The Slum*, 404.
58. Riis, *Children of the Poor*, 38.
59. *Ibid.*
60. Riis, *How the Other Half Lives*, 181.
61. *Ibid.*
62. Riis, *Children of the Poor*, 199.
63. *Ibid.*, 189.
64. *Ibid.*, 209-210.
65. *Ibid.*, 208.
66. "Factories of New York: Annual Report of State Inspector O'Leary," *New York Times*, January 18, 1897, 3.
67. "Factories of New York."
68. "Factories of New York."
69. Riis, *Battle with the Slum*, 235.
70. "Factories of New York."
71. Riis, *Children of the Poor*, 94.

Book Reviews

James Trimmer

Galileo, Bellarmine, and the Bible: A Delicate Treatment of a Contentious Issue

Richard J. Blackwell, author of *Galileo, Bellarmine and the Bible*, argues that the Galileo Affair and the Bible as two different claims to truth. According to Blackwell, the nineteenth century saw many writers such as John William Draper use the Galileo Affair to posture against worldviews based on either science or religion, and many who studied the Galileo Affair in the context of theological or religious history. Blackwell wrote *Galileo, Bellarmine and the Bible* in the interest of addressing the affair from a perspective that acknowledges the Galileo Affair as a historical event. Blackwell does not aim to solely address issues of theology, but to combine them with those of science in order to determine why the trial proceeded the way it did. *Galileo, Bellarmine and the Bible* ultimately moves to address the

mindset of Galileo and his Copernican supporters, as well as that of his critic, Cardinal Robert Bellarmine, his clergymen and the Aristotelian philosophers who supported them. Furthermore, these mindsets cannot be understood without placing them inside the context of logic and belief systems of the seventeenth century. It is here that Blackwell goes beyond creating an effective thesis to treat the reader to an engrossing level of detail on then-contemporary cosmology. Keeping close to the concepts of both logic and reason, Blackwell is able to overlap theology and science and deliver an analysis which is both engaging and nonbiased. It becomes clear through this analysis that the only way to truly

turn based on scriptural interpretation. In the subsequent section, *Galileo's Initial Response*, the reader is given a look into both the logic and rationale behind the views of Galileo. The reader is shown how Galileo believed that while the Bible was inviolably true, its interpreters were not, and that it was a book that clearly outlined the steps towards salvation, but was ambiguous on the subject of nature. While the Catholic Galileo was not above referring to Scripture, the author clearly shows that he placed his faith in the truth of science when understanding nature, stating himself that "the language of the Bible is often ambiguous while that of nature is not."⁴ Galileo believed that truths established through experience and rational proof, such as his observations were certain on the condition that these truths applied only to the human understanding of nature. Because a human understanding of nature is not a prerequisite for Christian salvation, God does not require humans to understand it according to Biblical terms. Because of this view, this Galileo asserted that, instead of placing Scripture before science, exegetes should reinterpret the Bible accordingly.

Ö^•]äc^Á@ä•Á: ^æ• [} ä } *ÉÁ [} ^Á { æb [!Á-æ&c [!Ác@æcæ- ' ä&c^áá [c@ÁÖæ]ä|^ [Áæ } äÁ@ä•Á& !äcä&•Á during the affair was their mutual failure to come to what Blackwell refers to as a "two world solution."⁵ As outlined frequently in the book as well as in reality, the concept of science and religions as means to determine ultimate truth are ä}Á& [} •cæ } cÁ& [} ' ä&cÁ , äc@Á [} ^Áæ } [c@^!ÉÁV@^Á { [ä^! } Éäæ^Áæ } • , ^!Ác [Ác@ä•Á] ! [ä|^ { Á ä•Ác@^Ác , [É , [!|äÁ• [| ~cä [] ÉÁ , @^!^ä } Á•&ä^ } &^Áä•Á ~•^äÁc [Á ä^ , } ^Ác@^Á } æc~!æ|Áæ } äÁ] @^•ä&æ|Á , [!|äÉÁæ } äÁ!^|ä*ä [] Áä•Á ~•^äÁc [Á ä^ , } ^Ác@^Á { ^cæ] @^•ä&æ|ÉÁ•] ä!äc~æ|Á , [!|äÉÁ While this system of belief may be compatible with the secular and democratic }æc~!Á [-Á|ä-^Áä } Ác@^Á|æc^Ác , ^ } cä^c@Áæ } äÁ^æ|!^Ác , ^ } c^É , !•cÁ&^ } c~!ä^•ÉÁäcÁ , æ•Á } [cÁ so during the seventeenth century. Both Galileo and Bellarmine knew that the concept of God, being directly related to creation itself, was too important of æ}Áä••~^Ác [Á|æçc^Á [~cä [-Á•&ä^ } cä , &Á•* *^•cä [] •Áæä [~cÄ } æc~!^ÉÁV@^!^!- [!^ÉÁæ } ^Á •&ä^ } cä , &Á~^•cä [] Ác@æcÁ!æä•^Áäá [~cÄ•Áæä [~cÄÖ@!ä•cäæ } Ác^æ&@ä } *Á& [~|äÁ } [cÄ^Á brushed aside as applying only to the natural world, because it would also apply to the spiritual world through extension. The result was that only one side, and one truth, could be correct.

One of the most interesting and eye-opening arguments made by Blackwell during his discussion of the beliefs of Bellarmine in Chapter Two, *Bellarmino's Views Before the Galileo Affair*, is the suggestion that his understanding of cosmology was neither based on Copernicanism nor Aristotelianism, but rather one that he himself had constructed. At the center the system constructed by Bellarmine was the concept of God as an ultimate truth, and that Bellarmine had based this belief purely on his own interpretation of the Scriptures and the early Christian Fathers. Blackwell explains that in the mind of Bellarmine, the Earth was round, unmoving, and in the center of the universe. The heavens were divided into three parts: "the airy one, the stary one and the emipraeum; the , !•cÁä•Á& [{]|^c^!^Ác!æ } •]æ!^ } cÄæ } äÁ]æ!cæ||^Á&æ]æä|^Á [-Á!^!^Ácä } *Á|ä* @cÉÁc@^Ác@ä!äÁ !^!^Á&c•Á|ä* @cÄæ|Á [Ç^!É^ÉÁV@^Á , !•cÁ@^Áçc^ } Á!^! } !^•^ } c^äÁc@^Áæä!Áæ } äÁæc { [•] @^!^Á [-Á

Earth, the second being home to the moon, sun and stars, and the third being the home to God. Bellarmine believed that the second heaven was made of soft matter that did not revolve around the center of the universe. He believed, according to scripture, that the realm was changeable, and could be dissolved at the will of God such as on Judgement Day. According to Blackwell, Bellarmine believed that because Jesuit astronomers had been distraught by the controversy over the Ptolemaic model, they were rarely in agreement over how to understand the heavens. These astronomers were all, on the other hand, united in the belief that where there is uncertainty, understanding should be changed in order to conform to the word of God. Bellarmine claims to truth.

One cannot understand the judgement of those who condemned Copernicanism during the trial of 1616 without understanding the role that religious faith played in their lives. Blackwell explains that natural beliefs are formed when the individual is given a claim, and then the opportunity to decide whether this claim is accurate. If this claim cannot be directly checked or tested, the individual has the free will to question whether the source of that claim is legitimate. Natural faith, in a Christian context, stems from an individual's ability to stake what is true in the word of God alone. Because God cannot lie or deceive, his word is automatically true, needing no proof, evidence or argument. Being the ultimate authority of truth, the word of God is enough to overcome any arguments made about the natural world, because it is his truth that governs the greater, transcendent world. Because the Papacy was tasked with interpreting the authority of God in seventeenth century Italy, the judges and inquisitors who went against Galileo were grounded in the virtue of obedience towards religious authority. The Catholic Church had historically institutionalized this authority within both its structure and teachings. The author attributes the injunction that Pope Paul V leveled against Galileo in 1616 to "the logic of centralized authority", where the logic of the Catholic Church is that the word of God alone is the ultimate authority.

Endnotes

1. Richard Blackwell, *Galileo, Bellarmine and the Bible* (Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press, 1991), 2.
2. *Ibid.*, 25.
3. *Ibid.*, 26.
4. *Ibid.*, 67.
5. *Ibid.*, 167.
6. *Ibid.*, 41.
7. *Ibid.*, 177.
8. *Ibid.*, 178.
9. *Ibid.*, 179.

